

THE IMPACT OF TEACHER TEACHING IN DEVELOPING CRITICAL THINKING ON STUDENTS' CRITICAL READING ABILITY

Lavifatul Munawaroh

Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris, Fakultas Keguruan dan Ilmu pendidikan,
Universitas Islam Malang
lavifatulmunawaroh@gmail.com

Abstract

Researchers believe that awareness and monitoring of comprehension processes are very important for developing one's reading skills. One of the main issues in the world of education today is concern about students' ability to read critically and evaluate the material they read. This research aims to investigate the impact of teacher teaching in developing critical thinking on students' critical reading abilities. To achieve this goal, we selected 50 students from private high schools with an age range of 16-18 years as research participants. They were then divided into two groups, namely the experimental group and the control group, after being homogenized through the Nelson test. Next, the same content in the form of ten reading texts was taught to both groups, with the only difference that the experimental group received training in critical reading strategies such as annotating, asking questions, detailing, summarizing, and concluding, while the control group applied a general comprehension approach. The results of data analysis using an independent t-test show that teaching critical reading strategies has a significant impact on the development of students' critical reading skills, resulting in rejection of the null hypothesis. These findings can have relevant implications for the Impact of Teacher Teaching in Developing Critical Thinking on Students' Critical Reading Ability, promoting learning in authentic, interactive, and student-focused environments in their reading classes.

Keywords: Critical Thinking, Student Critical Reading, Teacher Teaching

Abstrak

Para peneliti meyakini bahwa kesadaran dan pemantauan proses pemahaman sangat penting untuk mengembangkan keterampilan membaca seseorang. Salah satu permasalahan utama dalam dunia pendidikan saat ini adalah kekhawatiran terhadap kemampuan siswa dalam membaca kritis dan mengevaluasi materi yang dibacanya. Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk menyelidiki dampak pengajaran guru dalam mengembangkan berpikir kritis terhadap kemampuan membaca kritis siswa. Untuk mencapai tujuan tersebut, kami memilih 50 siswa SMA swasta dengan rentang usia 16-18 tahun sebagai peserta penelitian. Mereka kemudian dibagi menjadi dua kelompok yaitu kelompok eksperimen dan kelompok kontrol setelah dihomogenisasi melalui uji Nelson. Selanjutnya konten yang sama berupa sepuluh teks bacaan diajarkan kepada kedua kelompok, dengan perbedaan hanya kelompok eksperimen mendapat pelatihan strategi membaca kritis seperti membuat anotasi, mengajukan pertanyaan, merinci, merangkum, dan menyimpulkan, sedangkan kelompok kontrol menerapkan pendekatan pemahaman umum. Hasil analisis data menggunakan uji-t independen menunjukkan bahwa pengajaran strategi membaca kritis mempunyai dampak yang signifikan terhadap pengembangan keterampilan membaca kritis siswa, sehingga hipotesis nol ditolak. Temuan ini dapat memiliki implikasi yang relevan terhadap Dampak Pengajaran Guru dalam Mengembangkan Berpikir Kritis pada Kemampuan Membaca Kritis Siswa, mendorong pembelajaran dalam lingkungan yang autentik, interaktif, dan berfokus pada siswa di kelas membaca mereka.

Kata Kunci: Berpikir Kritis, Membaca Kritis Siswa, Guru Mengajar



© Author(s) 2024

This work is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).

INTRODUCTION

In recent years, there has been increasing interest in developing students' critical thinking skills to improve their learning abilities and help them achieve their educational goals.¹ This process of awareness and monitoring is often referred to as metacognition. Recent research results show that the use of metacognitive strategies can differentiate between successful and unsuccessful learners, with the more knowledge students have about how they learn, the better their learning abilities.²

Issues related to critical thinking have become a relevant focus in the second language learning process, especially in the context of students' ability to carry out critical evaluations of the material they read.³ Critical reading is taught as an integral part of comprehension skills with appropriate practice provided. Critical reading has several characteristics that are clearly related to critical thinking.⁴

Among these characteristics include the ability to preview, understand context, ask questions for better understanding, reflect on challenges to personal beliefs and values, elaborate and summarize, evaluate arguments, and compare and contrast related readings. When teaching critical reading, it is necessary to consider differences in students' individual learning styles and needs.⁵

Reading comprehension skills involve an active, dynamic, and developing process in looking for reciprocal relationships in a text.⁶ This comprehension refers to the way readers understand propositions – the basic units of meaning in texts that include words, phrases, sentences, and paragraphs. Therefore, as long as the reader understands the meaning of a particular proposition,

¹ Syaadia Arifin, "The Role of Critical Reading to Promote Students' Critical Thinking and Reading Comprehension," *Jurnal Pendidikan dan Pengajaran* 53, no. 3 (October 20, 2020), <https://doi.org/10.23887/jpp.v53i3.29210>.

² A. S. Puspita and S. Aloysius, "Developing Student's Critical Thinking Skills through Implementation of Problem Based Learning Approach," *Journal of Physics: Conference Series* 1241, no. 1 (June 2019), <https://doi.org/10.1088/1742-6596/1241/1/012020>.

³ Chris Kooloos et al., "Developing Mathematical Whole-Class Discussions: An Exploratory Study of Teachers' Learning Paths," *Teaching and Teacher Education* 134 (November 2023), <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2023.104257>.

⁴ Nida Husna, "Developing Students' Critical Thinking Through an Integrated Extensive Reading Program," *TEFLIN Journal - A Publication on the Teaching and Learning of English* 30, no. 2 (August 7, 2019), <https://doi.org/10.15639/teflinjournal.v30i2/212-230>.

⁵ Made Anita Restuningsih, Dantes Nyoman, and Nyoman Sudiana, "Kemampuan Membaca Kritis Ditinjau dari Kemampuan Berpikir Kritis dan Minat Membaca pada Siswa Kelas V SD Kristen Harapan Denpasar," *PENDASI: Jurnal Pendidikan Dasar Indonesia* 1, no. 1 (March 3, 2017), <https://doi.org/10.23887/jpdi.v1i1.2680>.

⁶ Auli Lehtinen, Emma Kostianen, and Piia Näykki, "Co-Construction of Knowledge and Socioemotional Interaction in Pre-Service Teachers' Video-Based Online Collaborative Learning," *Teaching and Teacher Education* 133 (October 2023), <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2023.104299>.

he is engaging in understanding.⁷

Reading strategies are operationally defined as "generally deliberate and planned activities that learners actively engage in, often repeatedly, to overcome the cognitive difficulties they are experiencing".⁸ Critical reading refers to careful, active, reflective, and analytical reading. This involves the ability to carefully locate information and ideas in texts. Critical reading provides opportunities for students to think and analyze information critically, which means they can see the context more broadly in relation to their critical understanding, and also gives them the opportunity to evaluate the context they encounter. This is done in a critical manner and often introduces and utilizes new vocabulary with deeper meaning.⁹

To improve critical reading abilities and higher order thinking skills in reading, there have been clear efforts in developing effective strategies, techniques and learning models. Steps such as inferring, questioning, annotating, finding the main idea, and summarizing are used to understand the text thoroughly and analyze it critically.¹⁰ Therefore, this research aims to determine the impact of teacher teaching in developing critical thinking on students' critical reading abilities.

RESEARCH METHODS

In this survey, we selected a sample from the community consisting of 50 high school students in private schools with English as a subject. The age of participants in this range is 16-18 years. The material used in this research consists of several elements, namely the Nelson Test to measure language skills, Flash Reading TOEFL 2nd edition, as well as a critical reading test developed and validated by researchers.¹¹

To ensure homogeneity of participants, a common proficiency test was used, namely the Nelson Test (Nelson Test, 300 B), which was adapted from the "Nelson Test of English". This test consists of 50 multiple choice grammar and vocabulary items. The reliability results of the Nelson test were obtained at 0.758 through a pilot study, and after being used in this research, the reliability

⁷ Kay Oddone, "The Nature of Teachers' Professional Learning through a Personal Learning Network: Individual, Social and Digitally Connected," *Teaching and Teacher Education: Leadership and Professional Development* 1 (December 2022), <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2022.100001>.

⁸ Kathryn J. Strom and Adrian D. Martin, "Toward a Critical Posthuman Understanding of Teacher Development and Practice: A Multi-Case Study of Beginning Teachers," *Teaching and Teacher Education* 114 (June 2022), <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2022.103688>.

⁹ P. Rajabi and M. S. Tabatabaee, "The Impact of Teaching Critical Reading Strategies on the Development of Critical Reading Ability of Iranian EFL Learners," *Journal of Applied Linguistics (Dubai)* 1, no. 1 (2015).

¹⁰ Klara Kager et al., "'We Were Thinking Too Much like Adults': Examining the Development of Teachers' Critical and Collaborative Reflection in Lesson Study Discussions," *Teaching and Teacher Education* 113 (May 2022), <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2022.103683>.

¹¹ Sugiyono, *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, Dan R&D*, vol. 9 (Bandung: Alfabeta, 2016).

of this test was measured to be 0.689. Next, participants were divided into two groups, namely the control group and the experimental group.

After taking the pretest, the experimental group was given explicit instructions regarding critical reading strategies, while the control group followed a general comprehension-based approach. After that, both groups were asked to take a critical reading post-test which had been developed and validated by researchers. This test consists of 5 sections with several multiple choice items in each section.¹² The total scores are added up and the final score is calculated. Next, the data obtained were analyzed using SPSS statistical software to test the research null hypothesis, which states that teaching critical reading strategies does not have a significant influence on the development of students' critical reading skills.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

As previously mentioned, the aim of the research was to identify the significant impact of teaching critical reading strategies on the development of students' critical reading skills. To answer this research question, we calculated the mean and standard deviation of both groups via SPSS 23 edition software.

To compare students' critical reading performance on the pre-test, a t-test was carried out.

Table 1. Descriptive Statistical Test Results from the Pre-test

Grouping	N	Mean	Std. Deviation	Std. Error Mean
CR 1.00	25	17.2778	.73892	.12891
2.00	25	17.1889	.55789	.11908

Table 2. Independent Sample T-test for Pre-test

		Levene's Test for Equality of Variances				t-test for Equality of Means				
		F	Sig.	t	df	Sig. (2tailed)	Mean Differe nce	Std. Error Differe nce	95% Confidence Interval of the Difference	
									Lower	Upper
CR	Equal Variances Assumed	4,478	,025	1,235	53,245	.125	.26667	.17833	- .04895	.61273

¹² Sugiyono.

	Equal Variances not Assumed			1,189	51,229	,119	.26667	.17833	- .05324	.61478
--	--------------------------------------	--	--	-------	--------	------	--------	--------	-------------	--------

The t-value > 0.05 in Table 2 indicates that the two groups show homogeneity in critical reading ability through an independent t-test. To compare students' critical reading performance on the post-test, we conducted a t-test.

Table 3: Descriptive Statistical Test Results from the Post-test

Grouping	N		Mean	Std. Deviation	Std. Error Mean
CR 1.00	25		16.2377	.68427	.16388
2.00	25		15.3878	1.00345	.22378

Table 4: Independent Sample T-test for Post-test

		Levelene's Test for Equality of Variances				t-test for Equality of Means						
		F	Sig.			t	df	Sig. (2tailed)	Mean Differe nce	Std. Error Differe nce	95% Confidence Interval of the Difference	
											Lower	Upper
CR	Equal Variances Assumed	4,785	,055	1,533	57,255	,000	1.50000	.24736	- 1.0489 5	1.61273		
	Equal Variances not Assumed			1,453	55,549	,000	1.50000	.24736	- 1.0532 4	1.61478		

The results listed in Table 4 show that there is a significant difference (Sig. 000 < 0.05) between the average performance of the experimental group and the control group in the critical reading post-test. Therefore, we can conclude that the impact of teacher teaching in developing critical thinking on students' critical reading abilities has a positive impact.

CONCLUSION

Based on the results of this study, we provide strong support for the important role of teaching critical reading strategies and we suggest that formal training in critical reading strategies can effectively strengthen students' ability to read critically. The results of this study are in line with

other research findings, such as those conducted by Parson (year) which aimed to investigate the relationship between the use of metacognitive strategies and students' critical reading abilities. The research specifically examined the effectiveness of teaching procedures designed to improve critical reading skills by training students in metacognitive strategies. Parson found that students instructed with this metacognitive training package, including questioning, summarizing, predicting, and speculating about the author's intent and purpose, became more aware of their own mental processes. The result is an increase in students' critical reading skills and general understanding.

Apart from that, these findings also support other research that has been conducted regarding the relationship between critical reading strategies and reading comprehension. The positive impact of using critical reading strategies on reading comprehension. The influence of summary writing on reading comprehension is explored. They found that summary writing effectively helped students' reading comprehension, because writing required greater concentration and attention.¹³

It is important to note that in this study, critical reading strategies were taught explicitly to participants throughout the treatment period. Explicit teaching of critical reading strategies is necessary to address reading comprehension and critical reading more effectively. Furthermore, these findings also support research showing that teaching critical reading strategies can increase students' motivation to learn English and read critically. Critical reading strategies are taught in reading classes, students' motivation to learn English increases. In addition, the effect of teaching critical reading strategies on intermediate level students' vocabulary retention. The results of their research show that teaching critical reading strategies has a significant effect on intermediate-level students' vocabulary retention.

All these findings provide a clear view of the importance of teaching critical reading strategies in the context of second language learning. This also shows that teaching critical reading strategies can provide significant benefits in developing students' critical reading skills and reading comprehension. Therefore, we recommend that critical reading strategies be included in language education curricula to create a more effective and challenging teaching method for future language learners.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Arifin, Syaadiyah. "The Role of Critical Reading to Promote Students' Critical Thinking and Reading Comprehension." *Jurnal Pendidikan dan Pengajaran* 53, no. 3 (October 20, 2020). <https://doi.org/10.23887/jpp.v53i3.29210>.

¹³ Bachtiar, "Tantangan Dan Strategi Penerapan Berpikir Kritis Pada Pembelajaran Online: Kajian Pustaka," *Jurnal Pemikiran Dan Pengembangan Sekolah Dasar (JP2SD)* 10, no. 2 (September 23, 2022), <https://doi.org/10.22219/jp2sd.v10i2.22308>.

- Bachtiar. "Tantangan Dan Strategi Penerapan Berpikir Kritis Pada Pembelajaran Online: Kajian Pustaka." *Jurnal Pemikiran Dan Pengembangan Sekolah Dasar (JP2SD)* 10, no. 2 (September 23, 2022). <https://doi.org/10.22219/jp2sd.v10i2.22308>.
- Husna, Nida. "Developing Students' Critical Thinking Through an Integrated Extensive Reading Program." *TEFLIN Journal - A Publication on the Teaching and Learning of English* 30, no. 2 (August 7, 2019). <https://doi.org/10.15639/teflinjournal.v30i2/212-230>.
- Kager, Klara, Anne Jurczok, Swantje Bolli, and Miriam Vock. "'We Were Thinking Too Much like Adults': Examining the Development of Teachers' Critical and Collaborative Reflection in Lesson Study Discussions." *Teaching and Teacher Education* 113 (May 2022). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2022.103683>.
- Kooloos, Chris, Helma Oolbekkink-Marchand, Rainer Kaenders, and Gert Heckman. "Developing Mathematical Whole-Class Discussions: An Exploratory Study of Teachers' Learning Paths." *Teaching and Teacher Education* 134 (November 2023). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2023.104257>.
- Lehtinen, Auli, Emma Kostiaainen, and Piia Näykki. "Co-Construction of Knowledge and Socioemotional Interaction in Pre-Service Teachers' Video-Based Online Collaborative Learning." *Teaching and Teacher Education* 133 (October 2023). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2023.104299>.
- Oddone, Kay. "The Nature of Teachers' Professional Learning through a Personal Learning Network: Individual, Social and Digitally Connected." *Teaching and Teacher Education: Leadership and Professional Development* 1 (December 2022). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tatelp.2022.100001>.
- Puspita, A. S., and S. Aloysius. "Developing Student's Critical Thinking Skills through Implementation of Problem Based Learning Approach." *Journal of Physics: Conference Series* 1241, no. 1 (June 2019). <https://doi.org/10.1088/1742-6596/1241/1/012020>.
- Rajabi, P., and M. S. Tabatabaee. "The Impact of Teaching Critical Reading Strategies on the Development of Critical Reading Ability of Iranian EFL Learners." *Journal of Applied Linguistics (Dubai)* 1, no. 1 (2015).
- Restuningsih, Made Anita, Dantes Nyoman, and Nyoman Sudiana. "Kemampuan Membaca Kritis Ditinjau dari Kemampuan Berpikir Kritis dan Minat Membaca pada Siswa Kelas V SD Kristen Harapan Denpasar." *PENDASI: Jurnal Pendidikan Dasar Indonesia* 1, no. 1 (March 3, 2017). <https://doi.org/10.23887/jpdi.v1i1.2680>.
- Strom, Kathryn J., and Adrian D. Martin. "Toward a Critical Posthuman Understanding of Teacher Development and Practice: A Multi-Case Study of Beginning Teachers." *Teaching and Teacher Education* 114 (June 2022). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2022.103688>.
- Sugiyono. *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, Dan R&D*. Vol. 9. Bandung: Alfabeta, 2016.